



# Holistic Review

Jack Buckley M.D.  
UCLA Medical Center

1



## Disclosures

- No relevant disclosures

2



## Relevant Experiences

- Assoc. Program Director 2014-2020
- Program Director 2020-Current
- Director of Residency Recruitment 2014 – Current
- Chair ASA Program Director Advisory Group
- Member of the ABA OSCE Committee

3



## Negatives of Holistic Review

- Resource intensive (30+ faculty)
- Time intensive
- Invitations for interview late

4



## Why Do Holistic Review?



**Finding diamond in the rough**



**Additional benefits**  
Interview fewer applicants  
Total cost is likely less

5



## Our Data – Recruitment Season 2021

|                            | UCLA | 25%  | 50%  | 75%  |
|----------------------------|------|------|------|------|
| Ranks per position         | 5.9  | 15.9 | 12.2 | 10.2 |
| Ranks per position to fill | 2.3  | 7.8  | 6    | 4    |

6



### Our process

- 1400+ applicants this year
- Do we review every application?
- We do an in-depth review of some applications
- Faculty reviewers 25-30 files
- Who gets reviewed?
  - Token
  - Geographic preference
  - Sub-I (told sub-I no need to send us a token- sub-I is a super token)
  - California address
  - California medical school
  - Historically black medical schools

7



### Additional Ways Applicants Get Reviewed

- ASA Meet and Greet Event
- Participation in our Virtual Open House
- Email PD
- Contact our residents or faculty member

8



### Faculty Reviewers

- Not compensated
- Expected to review the file in full
- Implicit Bias training
- Detailed instructions
- Significant variability
  - Reviewer "recommend" offering an interview
  - Reviews are reviewed by PD/APD
- PD/APD offer interviews

9

### Factors Considered In The Review

- Medical School
- College/other degree
- AOA
- Step scores
- Dean's letter
- Letters of rec
- Research
- Leadership
- Extracurricular and community engagement
- Work Experience
- Resilience and life challenges
- Supplemental application

10



| Research | Rating           |  |
|----------|------------------|--|
|          | 4 Transformative | First Author publication, funded research (ie FAER fellowship) |
|          | 3 Sustained      | several middle author publications                             |
|          | 2 Casual         | abstract   |
|          | 1 Observer/none  | none   |
|          | 1 Observer/none  | none   |

11



### Process

- Reviewers given 3 weeks to review
- Reviews uploaded to excel document
- Goal to invite 2/3 interview spots round 1
- Remaining positions rounds 2-3

12



## Interview Day

- 7 applicants interviewed per day
- PD, 2 faculty and 1 Chief resident interviews
  - Goal each faculty member interviews 3 times
- Chair group session
- 20 minute interview

13



## Interview Form

INTERVIEW EVALUATION FORM  
INTERDISCIPLINARY RESIDENCY

Interview Date: \_\_\_\_\_ Interviewer Name: \_\_\_\_\_ Interviewer Title: \_\_\_\_\_

PLEASE RATE ACCORDING TO INTERVIEW AND CANDIDATE'S APPLICATION PACKAGE

| RATING:                                    | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 |
|--|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|----|
| Overall Rating                             |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |
| Quality of Communication                   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |
| Communication Skills (Written/Oral Skills) |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |
| Problem Solving                            |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |
| Team Experience                            |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |
| Leadership/Teamwork Skills                 |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |
| Professionalism (Meds, Quality, Safety)    |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |   |    |

GRADE SCALE: STEP 1 \_\_\_\_\_ STEP 2 \_\_\_\_\_ STEP 3 \_\_\_\_\_

COMMENTS: \_\_\_\_\_

14



## Rank List Meeting

- Goal to make it objective as possible
- Minimize
  - "They would be a good fit"
  - "I like this applicant better"
- Rank list is a massive excel document

15



Jack Buckley M.D.

UCLA Program Director

[jcbuckley@mednet.ucla.edu](mailto:jcbuckley@mednet.ucla.edu)

16